Revision 1 of the German Public Review Comments
Programming Language C++

The following are the status of the German Public Review comments prior to the delivery the Working Paper as a CD-2.

One Definition Rule (ODR)

CD14882 comment:

The ODR is one of the important requirements for the CD-Ballot already mentioned as R-31 in the Disposition of comments on CD Registration (Doc No: ISO/IEC JTC1/SC22/WG21/N0669) by the German delegation. The ODR is not described in the Draft which is base for this CD-Ballot (although we know that it was defined and voted in for the next issue of the Draft).

Status Revision 1:

We think, that this issue has sufficiently been addressed within the latest Draft Proposed Working Paper WG/N0996, X3J16/96-178. The issue is closed.

Template Compilation Model

CD14882 comment:

We doubt that the template model as specified is defined clear enough so that it can be used in a portable way. It is also not clear whether context merging problems keep the user from determining the cause of errors since the context for some specialization has been syntesized by the compiler in a non-obvious and complex way.

The context merge might also force implementors to store/retrieve lots of information (persistent symbol table) which can lead to a less efficient implementation.

Status Revision 1:

Although the context merging problems were addressed by the committee, the German DIN Working Group has still concerns about the implementability of the recently adopted seperate compilation model since there was currently no implementation of this scheme so that its workability could have been proven sufficiently. Therefore, Germany abstains from voting this model into the Working Paper, in July 1997 in Stockholm. It is possible, that this issue will be raised in comments during the CD-2.

Locale Library

CD14882 comment:

The locale's functionality shall be in accordance with the C locale defined by POSIX and X/OPEN. It is not clear whether this has in principel been accepted for the C++ locale design. The C++ locale should be efficiently implementable on top of the C locale.

Revision 1:

We think, that the issue has been address by the committee.

Input/Output Library

CD14882 comments:

This library seems far from being complete; there is still a lot of open work. We think unless more effort is spent on this part of the library it will fail the schedule.

Status Revision 1:

Suffiently progress have been made during the last meetings and most open issues have been closed. So, we thing this comment is satisfactory solved.

R-15 Other issues

CD14882 comments:

The are a lot of outstanding issues listed in the German public review comments (X3J16/95-0132, WG21/N0732) which are not addressed by this Draft.

Status Revision 1:

The list mentioned above has been updated (X3J16/96-0051, WG21/N0869) and is therefore added to this document. From that list, the following items are solved by the current Draft (X3J16/96-0178, WG21/N0996): 19, 20, 21. All other issues must be checked against the CD-2 WP and will be kept open until CD-2 Ballot. With CD-2 Ballot, we will provide an update of this table. However, the German Delegation has no objections shipping CD-2 with this open issues.

2. German public review comments

No.	Comment	Author	incoming Date	WP chapter	DIN WG Topic leader	related Document	German WG vote must,shall,nice ,apposed, abstain	Re-commen-dation for ISO/ANSI [status]
1	Derived Classes comments	Ulrich Eisenecker	26.6.1995	10	Eisenecker	Email: 26.6.95 X3J16: edit-561	not voted on	**yes**, [open]
2	Numerics Library	Ulrich Eisenecker	26.6.1995	26	Eisenecker	Email:26.6.95 X3J16: edit-564	not voted on	**yes**, [open]
3	class auto_ptr: the copy ctor should be private to forbid parameter passing of auto_ptr per value.	Uli Breymann	30.6.1995	20.4.5	Bormann, Breymann	Email: 21.5.95 X3J16: edit-566	not voted on	**yes**, [open]
4	What is „m" ?	Uli Breymann	30.6.1995	23.3.1 p. 23-32	Bormann, Breymann	Email: 21.5.95 X3J16: edit-568	not voted on	**yes**, [open]
5	Logic error: replace !(*i > *j) with !(*i < *j)	Uli Breymann	30.6.1995	25.3.2 p. 25-20	Bormann, Breymann	Email:21.5.95 X3J16:lib-3822	not voted on	**yes**, [open]
6	Findings in chapter 20,23,24,25	Carsten Bormann	30.6.95	20	Bormann, Breymann	Fax: 30.6.95 X3J16: edit-579 lib-3829	not voted on	**yes**, [open]
7	Layout compatible types	Manfred Lichtmannegger	30.6.95	3.9	Unruh	X3J16: edit-576	not voted on	**yes**, [arrays still open]
8	pop() should return a value	Nicolai Josuttis	6.12.95	23.2.4.1 23.2.4.2 23.2.4.3	Kiefer	X3J16: lib-4496	pop_value()	**yes** [open]
9	Mandate for bad_alloc	Ulrich Eisenecker	7.12.95	26.3	Kiefer	X3J16: lib-?	not voted on	**yes** [open]
10	Can the class instantiated by the user ?	Ulrich Eisenecker	7.12.95	26.3.2.4 footnote 219	Kiefer	X3J16: lib-?	not voted on	**yes** [open]
11	Design of basic_istream and basic_ostream	Udo Mueller	8.12.95	27	Kiefer, Lichtmann-egger	X3J16: lib-?	note that op << with int is not possible	**yes** [open]
12	Editorial issues	Udo Mueller	8.12.95	20.3.6.1 20.4.1.1 20.4.1.3	Kiefer	X3J16: lib-?	not voted on	**yes** [open]
13	Editorial issues	Udo Mueller	8.12.95	27	Kiefer	X3J16: lib-?	not voted on	**yes** [open]
14	Wrong Specifications for Logical Iterator Conditions	Ulrich Breymann	6.1.96	25.3.3.1	Kiefer	X3J16: lib-?	not voted on	**yes** [open]
15	Missing iterator parameter	Ulrich Breymann	24.1.96	24.3.2.6.5	Kiefer	X3J16: edit-?	not voted on	**yes** [open]
16	Instantiation of virtual functions in templates	Udo Müller	13.2.96	14.3.2, §6	Unruh		**apposed** (4:1)	**no**
17	Minor Typos	Nicolai Josuttis	8.12.95	21.1.1.8.3 21.1.1.9.1 23.2.1 23.2.1.2	Kiefer	X3j16: edit-624	not voted on	**yes** [open]
18	Remove find_first, rfind and find_last	Nicolai Josuttis	8.12.95	21.1.1.9.3 21.1.1.9.4	Kiefer	X3j16: edit-624	WG recommends an informative vote	**yes** [open]
19	Introduce const & bitset::operator[] () const	Nicolai Josuttis	8.12.95	23.2.1	Kiefer	X3J16: lib-4496	not voted on	**yes** [open]

20	Specify #include <iterator> for containers	Nicolai Josuttis	24.1.96	21.1 23.2 23.3	Kiefer	X3J16: lib-4496	not voted on	**yes** [open]
21	capacity() and reserve()	Nicolai Josuttis	24.1.96	21.1.1.6 23.2.5.4	Kiefer	X3j16: lib-4496	not voted on	**yes** [open]
22	Move min(), max() swap() into utility part	Nicolai Josuttis	24.1.96	25 -> utility	Kiefer	X3j16: lib-4496	not voted on	**yes** [open]
23	Move bitset section	Nicolai Josuttis	19.2.96	23.4	Kiefer	X3J16: edit-624	not voted on	**yes** [open]
24	Distance n=0	Ulrich Breymann	19.2.96	24.1.6	Kiefer	X3J16: edit-?	not voted on	**yes** [open]
25	Access to Exception Object's Type Information	Roland Hartinger	6.3.96	5.2.7 15.5.4 18.5.3	Hartinger	X3J16/96-0052 WG21/N0870 core-6404	not voted on	**yes** [open]